



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_6615
Title of the Manuscript:	Sugarcane Genotype Performance in Three Environments (Based on Crop Cycle) at Mardan, Pakistan

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
This study is not related to traditional G x E study as known worldwide! It is better as assessment of genotypes performance in different cropping systems. I suggested some reference to authors to analyse my suggestions. The results discussion is still the weakness of this paper: there is little explanation of results which were just presented whereas; we need to understand the observations and to compare them with similar studies elsewhere.	Comment K1: Genotypes, most often, respond differently to different environments. These environments could be sites or locations, years, different irrigation, fertility levels and so on. The said study comprised 2 plant crops grown in 2 different years with a ratoon crop in one year. That is the reason they have been considered as different environments. Comments K3-K5: Discussion for the subsections is given at the end of the results. Any further improvement in the discussion would be welcomed.